

# Livermore Area Recreation and Park District

## Staff Report

---

---

TO: Chair Furst and Board of Directors

FROM: Mathew Fuzie, General Manager 

PREPARED BY: Patricia Lord, Assistant General Manager

DATE: July 31, 2019

SUBJECT: Audio/Video Recording of Board Meetings (Discussion and Direction)

COMMITTEE: Reviewed by Finance Committee on April 25, 2019

---

---

**RECOMMENDATION:** That the Board of Directors consider options and provide direction to staff on audio/video recording of Board of Director meetings. At the April 25, 2019 Finance Committee meeting, Directors discussed this topic and directed staff to provide more information to the full Board on options and associated costs with various levels of service.

**BACKGROUND:** Livermore Area Recreation and Park District promotes transparency in its operations and governance of the District to the public. LARPD maintains a District website that meets the requirements for District of Transparency Certificate of Excellence as set forth by the Special District Leadership Foundation, and meets additional outreach best practices. Audio or video recordings of board meetings are outlined as an additional option. (See Attachment - SDLF District Transparency Certificate of Excellence)

LARPD currently contracts services with Tri-Valley Community Television to record and broadcast certain public meetings, typically regular Board of Directors meetings. The meetings are delay broadcasted on Comcast, AT&T, and U-verse at specific times, and are repeated a minimum of six times before the next meeting. In addition to the audio/video recording of meetings, staff prepares meeting minutes which are posted on the LARPD website. Staff was unable to get data on viewership of specific meetings, but from October to December 2018, 141 people looked at the LARPD name on Tri-Valley Community Television's website.

For comparison with other nearby recreation and park special districts, staff surveyed both East Bay Regional Park District (EBRPD) and Hayward Area Recreation and Park District (HARD). EBRPD discontinued televising meetings due to cost considerations and began using audio in 2018; they record the meetings in-house and post them online. HARD has written meeting minutes, but does not currently have audio or televised recordings of meetings. Both agencies reported generally very little or no attendance at their meetings. The City of Livermore contracts with Tri-Valley Community Television to broadcast the meetings live, replay it on Channel 29 and provide video-on-demand services. The City also has their minutes chapterized, so the public can click on a portion of the minutes and the video will jump to that corresponding section of the recorded meeting.

OPTIONS WITH VARIOUS LEVELS OF SERVICE: In reviewing options from lower to higher levels of service, with any of the options discussed below, staff would continue to take meeting minutes and post them online.

**OPTION 1: Reduce level of service to meeting minutes only, no audio or video recording.**

Description: Staff would continue taking meeting minutes and post them online, without any audio or video recording, like Hayward Area Recreation and Park District.

Cost: Staff time only.

Pros: No cost for audio or video recording.

Cons: The public would not be able to view or hear recordings of the meetings. This option does not help maintain the District of Transparency Certificate, though the District could still maintain the certificate by meeting other requirements.

**OPTION 2: Reduce level of service to audio only.**

Description: LARPD's current sound system has the capacity to record audio which could then be uploaded to the LARPD website by staff using *Sound Cloud* for approximately \$10 per month. Staff would continue taking meeting minutes and post them online.

Cost: Additional staff time and approximately \$10 per month for *Sound Cloud*.

Pros: The public would be able to hear recordings of the meetings. This option is low cost and would help maintain the District's Transparency Certificate.

Cons: The public would not be able to view video.

**OPTION 3: No change in level of service, maintain current services with Tri-Valley Community Television.**

Description: Maintain contract with Tri-Valley Community Television to record and broadcast certain public meetings, typically regular Board of Directors Meetings. Meetings are delayed broadcasted on Comcast, AT&T, and U-verse and are repeated a minimum of six times before the next meeting. Staff would continue taking meeting minutes and post them online.

Cost: The District spent approximately \$10,800 in FY 2018/19 and anticipates higher rates in FY 2019/20.

Pros: This option would help maintain the District's Transparency Certificate. The public can view the meetings when they air on television.

Cons: Meetings are broadcasted on television at scheduled times, but the public cannot select the specific agenda item that they want to view at their convenience.

**OPTION 4: Increase level of service with Tri-Valley Community Television.**

Description: Like the City of Livermore, LARPD could contract with Tri-Valley Community Television to broadcast the meeting live, replay it on Channel 29 and provide video-on-demand services. The City also has their minutes chaptered, so the public can click on a portion of the minutes and the video will jump to that corresponding section of the recorded meeting.

Cost: The City has approximately 22 recorded meetings per year and in FY 2018/2019, they budgeted \$30,000 for the video services.

Pros: This option would help maintain the District's Transparency Certificate. The public can view the meetings online and on television. The public can easily view the item in which they are specifically interested via the chaptered minutes.

Cons: This option is more approximately \$20,000 more expensive than our current level of service with Tri-Valley Community Television.

**OPTION 5: Use a different provider, other than Tri-Valley Community Television, to record meetings.**

Description: Other companies offer a variety of options, including video streaming via the website and recorded video for playback. Dublin San Ramon Services District is researching this possibility.

Cost: Per Dublin San Ramon Services District's research, *Swagit* offers a three-camera set up for \$42,565 with \$995 monthly rate for services. Adding social media streaming is \$125 per month.

Pros: This option would help maintain the District's Transparency Certificate. The public could view the meetings online.

Cons: Though this option gives the public the easiest accessibility to view meetings, it is also the most expensive.

FISCAL IMPACT: The fiscal impact will vary depending on which option the Board recommends. The cost for Professional Services is budgeted in Unit No. 17 – Marketing and Public Information and may be absorbed in the FY 2019/20 Operating Budget.

ATTACHMENT:

- A. Special District Leadership Foundation District Transparency Certificate of Excellence



SHOWCASE YOUR DISTRICT'S COMMITMENT TO TRANSPARENCY

## District Transparency Certificate of Excellence

### Purpose

To promote transparency in the operations and governance of special districts to the public/constituents and provide special districts with an opportunity to showcase their efforts in transparency.

### Duration

2 Years

### Application Cost

FREE

### District Receives

- Certificate for display (covering 2 years)
- Press release template
- Recognition on the SDLF website
- Letter to legislators within the district's boundaries announcing the achievement
- Recognition in social media, letter to the editor of local media outlet, and the CSDA eNews
- Window cling

### Basic Requirements

#### Current Ethics Training for All Board Members *(Government Code Section 53235)*

- Provide names of board members and copies of training certificates along with date completed

#### Compliance with the Ralph M. Brown Act *(Government Code Section 54950 et. al )*

- Provide copy of current policy related to Brown Act compliance
- Provide copy of a current meeting agenda (including opportunity for public comment)

#### Adoption of Policy Related to Handling Public Records Act Requests

- Provide copy of current policy

#### Adoption of Reimbursement Policy, If District Provides Any Reimbursement of Actual and Necessary Expenses

*(Government Code Section 53232.2 (b))*

- Provide copy of current policy

#### Annual disclosure of board member or employee reimbursements for individual charges over \$100 for services or products. This information is to be made available for public inspection. "Individual charge" includes, but is not limited to: one meal, lodging for one day, or transportation. *(Government Code Section 53065.5)*

- Provide copy of the most recent document and how it is accessible.

#### Timely Filing of State Controller's Special Districts Financial Transactions Report -

**Includes Compensation Disclosure.** *(Government Code Section 53891)*

- Provide copy of most recent filing.

*SDLF staff will verify that district is not listed on the State Controller's 'non-compliance list'*

#### Conduct Audits As Required By Law *(Government Code Section 26909 and 12410.6)*

- Provide copy of most recent audit, management letter, and a description of how/where documents were made available to the public

#### Other Policies – Have Current Policies Addressing the Following Areas

*Provide copies of each:*

- Conflict of Interest
- Provide copies of Form 700 cover sheet for board members and general manager
- Code of Ethics/Values/Norms or Board Conduct
- Financial Reserves Policy

**Website Requirements**

**Maintain a district website with the following items Required.** (provide direct website links for each item) - Required items available to the public:

- Names of board members and their full terms of office to include start and end date
- Name of general manager and key staff along with contact information
- Election/appointment procedure and deadlines
- Board meeting schedule  
(Regular meeting agendas must be posted 72 hours in advance pursuant to *Government Code Section 54954.2 (a)(1)* and *Government Code Section 54956 (a)*)
- District's mission statement
- Description of district's services/functions and service area
- Authorizing statute/Enabling Act (Principle Act or Special Act)
- Current District budget
- Most recent financial audit
- Archive of Board meeting minutes for at least the last 6 months
- Link to State Controller's webpages for district's reported board member and staff compensation (*Government Code Section 53908*)
- Link to State Controller's webpages for district's reported Financial Transaction Report (*Government Code Section 53891 (a)*)
- Reimbursement and Compensation Policy
- Home page link to agendas/board packets (*Government Code Section 54957.5*)
- SB 272 compliance-enterprise catalogs (*Government Code Section 6270.5*)

**Additional items – website also must include at least 4 of the following items:**

- Post board member ethics training certificates
- Picture, biography and e-mail address of board members
- Last (3) years of audits
- Financial Reserves Policy
- Online/downloadable public records act request form
- Audio or video recordings of board meetings
- Map of district boundaries/service area
- Link to California Special Districts Association mapping program
- Most recent Municipal Service Review (MSR) and Sphere of Influence (SOI) studies (full document or link to document on another site)
- Link to [www.districtsmakethedifference.org](http://www.districtsmakethedifference.org) site or a general description of what a special district is
- Link most recently filed to FPPC forms
- Machine readable/searchable agendas (*required in 2019*)

**Outreach/Best Practices Requirements - (Must complete at least 2 of the following items)**

**Regular district newsletter or communication (printed and/or electronic) that keeps the public, constituents and elected officials up-to-date on district activities (at least twice annually)**

- Provide copy of most recent communication and short description on the frequency of the communication, how it's distributed and to whom.

**Community notification through press release to local media outlet announcing upcoming filing deadline for election or Appointment and process for seeking a position on the district board, prior to that election (or prior to the most recent deadline For consideration of new appointments for those districts with board members appointed to fixed-terms).**

- Provide copy of the press release (and the printed article if available)

**Complete salary comparison/benchmarking for district staff positions using a reputable salary survey (at least every 5 years)**

- Provide brief description of the survey and process used as well as the general results

**Special Community Engagement Project**

Designed and completed a special project promoting community engagement with the district (potential projects may be broad in nature or focus on specific issues such as rate-setting, recycled water, identifying community needs, etc.)

- Submit an overview of the community engagement project reviewing the process undertaken and results achieved

**Hold annual informational public budget hearings that engage the public (outreach, workshops, etc.) Prior to adopting the budget**

- Provide copy of most recent public budget hearing notice and agenda.

**Community Transparency Review**

The district would be required to obtain a completed overview checklist from at least 2 of the following individuals (the district may choose to conduct the overview with these individuals simultaneously or separately):

- Chair of the County Civil Grand Jury
- Editor of a reputable local print newspaper (only one may count toward requirement)
- LAFCO Executive Officer
- County Auditor-Controller
- Local Legislator (only one may count toward requirement)
- Executive Director or President of local Chamber of Commerce
- General Manager of a peer agency (special district, city, county, neighborhood association, community organization or county administrative officer)

- Provide proof of completion signed by individuals completing Community Transparency Review