



"We are a welcoming, active and business-friendly rural foothill community built on California's rich gold rush history."

Planning Commission Staff Report

Meeting Date: May 5, 2026

Prepared By: Carole Kendrick, Development Services Director

PROJECT INFORMATION SUMMARY

Case File: Historic Design Review (HDR) 26-01
2896 Clay Street / APN 002-121-007

Request: Consideration of a Historic Design Review application within the Single-Family Residential / Historic District Zone for modifications to an existing single-family residence, including: (1) replacement of windows; (2) replacement of siding; (3) repair/replacement of the garage door; and (4) repairs to the deck; (5) and replacement of fencing, fascia, gutters and soffits. The project also includes a request to find it categorically exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per CEQA Guidelines Section 15301.

Summary Recommendation: Staff recommends approval of the requests, subject to the conditions of approval in Attachment A.

<u>Property Owner/Applicant:</u>	Amanda & Evan Bernavage
<u>Address:</u>	2896 Coloma Street
<u>APN:</u>	002-121-007
<u>Lot Area:</u>	0.22 acres
<u>General Plan:</u>	High Density Residential, HDR
<u>Zoning:</u>	R-2 Low Density Multi-Family Residential / Historic (R2/H)
<u>Existing Use:</u>	Single-family Residential
<u>Environmental Document:</u>	Categorically Exempt per §15301 of the CEQA Guidelines

Decision Making Authority: The Planning Commission is authorized under Zoning Ordinance Sections 10-4-9(H) (Site Plan Review) and 10-4-10 (Historical Buildings in the City) to review and approve, approve with conditions, or disapprove applications for projects located in any of the City's historical districts.

SITE INFORMATION

The site is a 0.22-acre parcel located on the west side of Clay Street south of Coleman Street. The property is developed with a single-family dwelling constructed in 1940, with a main floor of approximately 1,083 square feet with an overall square footage of 1,318 and is designated as 1.5 stories on the El Dorado Assessor's records. The dwelling is located within the Bedford Avenue/Clay Street Historic District but is not included in the City's Historic Resources Inventory and ~~is classified~~ could be considered as a non-contributor per the historic survey. The front of the dwelling is visible from the public right-of-way.

The dwelling was constructed in 1940. While within the City's Bedford Avenue/Clay Street Historic District, the single-family dwelling is not included in the City's Historic Resources Inventory, or in the State or the National Register of Historic Places. Attachment E provides the location of the subject parcel within the historic district. The front of the dwelling is oriented towards and is visible from Clay Street.

Background

City records show minimal permit history for the subject parcel are provided as follows:

- BP 7260 Re-roof issued in 1984
- BP 15214 Partial re-roof issued in 2009
- BP 17108 Electrical repair issued in 2014
- BP 17116 Electrical repair issued 2014 (reactivating BP17108)
- BP 20383 Electrical repair issued 2020 (reactivating BP17116)

Code Compliance

The Development Services Department (DSD) became aware of and created the code compliance case (CE 2026-035) for the property in 2026, with a Notice to Correct was sent March 30, 2026.

The applicant submitted a building permit application into plan check for the proposed project (BP 2026-137) on April 1, 2026; however, due to the modification to the exterior the project was suspended pending Planning Commission approval. The property owner submitted for the Historic Design Review on April 27, 2026, and remains in communication with Code Enforcement.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The proposed project includes the following upgrades:

1. Window Replacement: Replacement of the existing single-pane aluminum 1-over-1 windows (with the exception of the front single-slider window) with new dual-pane Anlin vinyl-framed 1-over-1 windows featuring Anlin glass. Window sizes, configurations, and operating styles (including the retained front slider) will remain unchanged. Nineteen windows were

identified as broken or failing. See Attachment B for the Good News Home Improvements quote and Anlin window specifications.

2. Siding Replacement: Removal and replacement of the existing horizontal vinyl siding (at end of service life) and associated layers, including asbestos-cement board shingles (abatement to be completed per code). Installation of horizontal plank composite siding in Flagship Brown with Glacier White trim. The product offers a realistic woodgrain texture, Class A fire rating, moisture resistance, impact resistance, and low maintenance. See the ASCEND Homeowner Brochure for product details and color information as shown in Attachment B. A rendering of the proposed color scheme has been provided.
3. Fascia, Gutters, and Soffit: Replacement of the existing failing green and white aluminum fascia, white gutters, and white vinyl soffits with new white aluminum fascia and white seamless stainless steel gutters (same-for-same). The existing soffit will be removed entirely to expose the original rafter tails, which will be painted according to the proposed color scheme.
4. Garage Door: Replacement of the existing failing engineered plywood garage door with premium-grade engineered plywood featuring a board-and-batten appearance.
5. Deck and Fence: Repairs to the deck framing, deck boards, and fencing as needed for safety and functionality (same-for-same where replaced).

PROJECT ANALYSIS

The following section provides an overview of relevant City of Placerville General Plan Goals, Zoning Ordinance(s), and Development Guide. Staff responses are provided below each italicized Goal, Ordinance, and Guideline.

General Plan Consistency:

Part II – Section II: Housing

Goal F: To preserve the existing housing stock.

4. *The City will continue to preserve historic structures within the City by encouraging re-use of viable buildings within historic buildings.*

The project is consistent with Goal F, Policy 4 in that the project would maintain the existing single-family residential use.

Part II – Section VII: Community Design

Goal C: To protect and enhance to the visual quality and neighborhood integrity of residential areas.

2. *New construction shall be architecturally compatible with the surrounding and/or adjacent neighborhoods. This policy shall be strictly enforced in designated Historic Neighborhoods.*

6. *The City shall encourage proper maintenance of homes, buildings, and yards to provide the best possible visual quality in each neighborhood.*

The subject dwelling is not listed as a historic resource. However, any exterior work visible from the right-of-way within a Historic District is evaluated for overall consistency with Zoning Ordinance 10-4-10 (Historic Buildings in the City). The project includes the replacement of windows, siding, garage door, deck and fencing at 2896 Clay Street

The project as proposed does not diminish the historic integrity of the District and continues the single-family residential use of the property.

Zoning Classification and Regulation Consistency:

Section 10-4-9: Site Plan Review

Under subsections (C) 6 and (H), exterior alterations of a building located in a Historic District and visible from the street require Planning Commission review and approval prior to undertaking such activity. Further analysis is provided below.

Section 10-4-10: Historical Buildings in the City

Under subsection (B) Historical Criteria, the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (SOI Standards and Guidelines) is the criteria to be used by the Commission in reviewing a Site Plan Review within a City Historic District. Per Subsection (F) Construction and Repairs, alterations to the exterior appearance of buildings within Historic Districts, where the alteration architecture is visible from the street, must conform to the historical criteria under Subsection (B). Per Subsection (H), no construction permit may be issued for an alteration to a building within a Historic District until the plans have been approved by the Planning Commission.

As previously mentioned, the structure is not included in the City's Historic Resources Inventory. However, Staff has evaluated this Site Plan Review request with respect to the compatibility with the SOI Standards and Guidelines per Section 10-4-10(B) and (F). This analysis is provided below.

1. *A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal changes to its distinctive materials, spaces, and spatial relationships.*

The single-family residential use is unchanged.

2. *The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and special relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.*

The project does not remove any remaining distinctive historic features. The dwelling has already lost most original exterior elements (windows, siding, porch light, etc.). The proposed work improves the property's condition while remaining compatible with the district.

3. *Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.*

The project does not introduce conjectural historic features.

4. *Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.*

The Bedford Avenue/Clay Street Historic District contains a mix of architectural styles. The subject dwelling, constructed in 1940, is classified as Craftsman style. The project does not involve changes to elements that have acquired historical significance.

5. *Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.*

The project does not impact any remaining distinctive historic materials or features of the subject property.

6. *Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.*

In this project, the severely deteriorated vinyl siding (and underlying asbestos-cement shingles over original redwood clapboard that cannot be restored) will be replaced with new ASCEND horizontal plank composite siding in Flagship Brown with Glacier White trim that provides a compatible horizontal emphasis and realistic woodgrain texture. The failing engineered plywood garage door will be replaced with a new premium-grade engineered plywood door featuring a board-and-batten appearance that matches the existing size and configuration. The replacement of the single-pane aluminum windows with dual-pane Anlin vinyl 1-over-1 windows maintains the exact same sizes, configurations, and operating styles. These replacements are necessary due to the advanced state of deterioration of the existing materials and are visually compatible with the historic character of the residence and the surrounding Bedford Avenue/Clay Street Historic District.

7. *Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.*

The project did not include chemical/physical treatments that would damage historic materials.

8. *Archaeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.*

There are no known archaeological resources associated with the site.

9. *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.*

The proposed replacements are differentiated from the historic fabric while remaining compatible in scale, proportion, and massing. The removal of the vinyl soffit to expose the original rafter tails is a positive enhancement of the Craftsman character.

10. *New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment will be unimpaired.*

The proposed modifications will not negatively affect the property or surrounding properties.

Placerville Development Guide Consistency:

Section IV. Architectural Design Guidelines

C. Design Factors

3. Façade Treatments and Exterior Elements

- a. Building facades adjacent to the right-of-way must demonstrate a pedestrian orientation, with a well-defined entry, windows, decorative elements, and appropriate ornamentation regardless of zoning classifications.*
- b. Historic elements and details of existing buildings should be retained wherever possible, rather than removing or replacing them. If it is impossible to retain such a feature, it should be duplicated in terms of location, size, materials and method of construction.*
- f. All sides of buildings which are visible from any public right-of-way will incorporate façade treatments, finishes and features which reflect the quality of the overall design.*

The building façade adjacent to the right-of-way maintains a pedestrian orientation with a well-defined entry and existing window patterns. Historic elements and details of the existing building have been retained wherever possible. Where replacement is necessary due to severe deterioration (including the failing siding, garage door, fascia, and gutters), the new features are compatible in location, size, and general character. The removal of the soffit will expose the original rafter tails, a positive Craftsman-style detail. All visible sides of the building will incorporate façade treatments, finishes, and features (including the new horizontal plank composite siding with realistic woodgrain texture and the proposed color scheme) that reflect the quality of the overall design and are compatible with the historic character of the Bedford Avenue/Clay Street Historic District.

4. Materials and Finishes

- b. Materials and finishes should be compatible with those used in surrounding architecture of historic value. Renovations or rehabilitations of historic buildings that*

introduce new materials most often destroy the integrity of their historic character, and this approach is discouraged.

The proposed ASCEND composite siding with realistic woodgrain texture, Anlin vinyl windows, and board-and-batten garage door are modern, durable materials selected to be visually compatible with the surrounding architecture while addressing moisture and maintenance challenges on the site.

Environmental Review: The City has reviewed this request and has determined that it is categorically exempt from environmental review pursuant to California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Section 15301 (Existing Facilities), in that it involves minor alterations to an existing structure that is not listed on City, State, or Federal historic resources inventories, and that would not result in an expansion of the single-family residential use.

RECOMMENDED PLANNING COMMISSION ACTION

Staff recommends that the Planning Commission take the following action:

- I. Make the following findings in support of the HDR 26-01 request:
 1. The request is exempt from environmental review, in that the project qualifies for a Categorical Exemption under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Section 15301 (Existing Facilities), in that it involves minor alterations to an existing structure that is not listed on City, State, or Federal historic resources inventories, and that would not result in an expansion of the single-family residential use.
 2. The project site, 2896 Clay Street (APN 002-121-007), contains a single-family residential dwelling constructed in 1940 that is located within the Bedford Avenue/Clay Street Historic District and ~~is classified~~could be considered as a non-contributor per the City's historic survey.
 3. The project request is consistent with Placerville General Plan Housing Element Goal F, Policy 4 in that the project preserves existing housing stock and improves the condition of an aging structure within the Bedford Avenue/Clay Street Historic District.
 4. The project request is consistent with Placerville General Plan Community Design Element Goal C in that the visual qualities of the proposed exterior alterations are compatible with the visual attributes of neighboring structures within the Historic District and will improve the overall appearance and maintenance of the property.
 5. The project request is consistent with the purpose, intent, and criteria of Zoning Ordinance §10-4-9 (Site Plan Review) and §10-4-10 (Historical Buildings in the City), including the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, as the proposed work does not remove distinctive historic features and utilizes materials and detailing that are compatible with the historic character of the district.

6. The project request is consistent with the City of Placerville Development Guide Architectural Design Guidelines, particularly Section IV, C.3 (Façade Treatments and Exterior Elements) and C.4 (Materials and Finishes), in that the building façade maintains a pedestrian orientation, historic elements are retained where possible, and all visible sides incorporate compatible façade treatments and finishes.
- II. Conditionally approve HDR 26-01 located at 2896 Clay Street, based on the project information and findings included in the Staff Report, and subject to the recommended Conditions of Approval included in Attachment A of the Staff Report dated May 5, 2026.

ATTACHMENT

- A. Draft Conditions of Approval
- B. Applicant Submittal Package
- C. Zoning Map
- D. General Plan Land Use Designation Map
- E. Bedford Avenue/Clay Street Historic District Map
- F. Aerial Photograph